

**Barnosky et al. 2012**

1. Are state shifts a top-down or bottom-up processes?
2. Direct vs indirect forcings?
3. The author suggests climate change and human population growth were major global forcings during the last glacial–interglacial transition. Can we really compare magnitudes of past and present forcings? What about 1970 vs today?
4. Consider figure 2. Thoughts?
5. What is the purpose of this paper? What are the authors' intentions?

**Dai et al. 2012**

1. Critical slowing down introduced rate (or speed) of recovery. Have we seen this before in other papers?
2. Does critical slowing down provide practical early warning signs of a fold bifurcation?
3. Can critical slowing down be observed in larger systems?
4. Critical slowing down and stochasticity. Are they separate or related concepts?